

Edwardsville Historic Preservation Commission
November Meeting Minutes

Date: Wednesday, November 13, 2019

Time: 7pm

Place: Council Chambers, City of Edwardsville City Hall, 118 Hillsboro Avenue, Edwardsville, IL 62025

I. CALL TO ORDER

Commission Chairman Tom May called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm.

II. ROLL CALL (present)

Present: Brandon Adair, John Hackett, Joe Hutton, (new HPC member) Stephanie Lantz, Tom May, Bob Nickrent, Reggie Resper, Kerry Smith and Jennifer Plocher Wilkins
(Excused absence: Ryan Downey)

III. CITIZENS WISHING TO ADDRESS HPC

IV. CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

a. COA #1: 409 Franklin Avenue (within Leclaire Historic District)

Developer/Homeowner: Sherri Wilhite and fiancé Jamie

Project:

1. Moved by John Hackett and seconded by Reggie Resper to accept COA #1 for discussion. Motion passed unanimously.

Request to install vinyl siding. It is a former Sears home. 2,600 square feet.

Owner and her fiancé say they attempted to paint surface of house, but it was not smooth. Originally stained (100 years ago) and then multiple layers (10-15) of paint were applied over the stain. Contractor (painter Randy Gibson) scraped, sanded house and applied primer and paint, but paint wasn't adhering to the cedar. House is vinyl sided on the second floor. Homeowner and fiancé say vinyl siding would help protect the structure. Jennifer Plocher Wilkins asked what the real issue is. They said contractor said the cedar would have to be filled in. \$20,000-\$40,000 estimate (vs \$10,000 to \$15,000 to cover home with vinyl siding).

HPC Chairman Tom May reminded us that we voted on this before and it was unanimously rejected with a vote of 8-0.

Roberts Rules says we don't have to hear this COA request again, Chairman May said, but we can use the provision called reconsideration to reconsider it. John Hackett made the motion to vote to reconsider the COA, Reggie Resper seconded it. Vote is in the affirmative to allow vinyl siding. Roll call vote: Brandon Adair no, John Hackett yes, Joe Hutton no, Stephanie Lantz no, Bob no, Reggie, Kerry no, Jennifer no, Tom, no. Motion failed 8-1.

- b. COA #2: 142 North Main Street, Tunnel Building (within Downtown Historic District) – building is above Runwell and Mojos**

Developer: J.G. Property Management

Contractor is Matt Pfund

1. Moved by John Hackett and seconded by Reggie Resper to accept COA #2 for discussion. Motion passed unanimously. Bob Nickrent made motion, Joe Hutton seconded to split COA #2 into 3 separate pieces and approve each individually: 1) center window, 2) 4 side windows, 3) paint removal.

Projects:

1. Center window: Request to install aluminum-clad windows on front (window replacement) – Joe Hutton says what exists on the windows (left side ones) today is not correct. Contractor Matt Pfund says windows will be flat with no eyebrow. In the center window, transoms are all radiused. Will recreate any vertical mulls as needed. using a rectangular window that extends up to the top of the arch. Pfund said the owner of the building did not feel a radiused wooden sash merited the additional cost. Windows will reach up into the sash of the window. The sash won't be affected and would stop at beginning of spring line. The sash will be behind the perimeter trim, which will be raised as high as possible. The spring line has a different radius with the arched top. Contractor has the ability to fill it in. These are not original windows...they're just standard wood windows. There's the ability to squeeze more of the vertical window into the archway...Quaker wood window with aluminum clad exterior. Joe Hutton referenced HPC relevant guidelines/policy on page 27. True double-hung, operable sash windows. What Pfund is proposing (arch-top window) has already been done on other historic buildings on Main Street: Gaiser, Bohm, Whisker Bones, Weber Funeral Home and the Wildey Theatre. Kerry Smith moved that the details of caps and mullions and rosettes are preserved...plinths and bottoms. Kerry Smith made motion; Reggie Resper seconded. Part 1 vote: Brandon Adair yes, John Hackett yes, Joe Hutton yes, Stephanie Lantz yes, Bob Nickrent yes, Reggie Resper yes, Kerry Smith yes, Jennifer Plocher Wilkins yes, Tom May, yes. Part 1 was unanimously approved.
2. 4 left-side windows (rectangular window with a shadow or solid eyebrow). Bob Nickrent moved, and Reggie Resper seconded top open it for discussion. A yes vote would allow an appearance/work like what we're looking at with 100 East Vandalia Street. Vote on 4 side windows: Brandon Adair yes, John Hackett yes, Joe Hutton no, Stephanie Lantz yes, Bob Nickrent no, Reggie Resper yes, Kerry Smith yes, Jennifer Plocher Wilkins no, Tom May no. Part 2 of COA approved by a margin of 5-4.
3. Paint Removal: Request to remove paint – similar process... wet abrasive cleaning as what we did on Laurie's Bar, low pressure
Bob Nickrent motioned to approve paint removal; Brandon Adair seconded.
Roll call vote: Brandon Adair yes, John Hackett yes Joe Hutton yes, Stephanie Lantz yes, Bob Nickrent yes, Reggie Resper yes, Kerry Smith yes Jennifer Plocher Wilkins yes, Tom May yes. Unanimous passage.

c. COA #3: 810 Troy Road (within LeClaire Historic District)

Developer: Kevin Flaiz

Project:

1. Request to pave driveway. Currently earth with thin layer of gravel. Proposing laying down asphalt over gravel. Says nearly all neighbors have asphalt. Walt agreed. Bob Nickrent motioned to accept COA for discussion, Brandon Adair seconded. Joe Hutton moved to bring COA #3 to a vote, Reggie Resper seconded. Roll call vote: Brandon Adair yes, John Hackett yes Joe Hutton yes, Stephanie Lantz yes, Bob Nickrent yes, Reggie Resper yes, Kerry Smith yes Jennifer Plocher Wilkins yes, Tom May yes. Unanimous passage.

d. COA #4: 118 Franklin Avenue

Developer Jamie Henderson

Homeowners: Kay & Melvin Eaker

Moved by Bob Nickrent and seconded by Reggie Resper to accept COA #4 for discussion. Motion passed unanimously.

Moved by Joe Hutton and seconded by Bob Nickrent to split COA #4 into 3 parts for voting purposes: 1) wood addition, 2) front porch renovations, 3) fence.

Projects:

1. Wood 1-story addition on back of home (to increase footprint of home) – Bob Nickrent moved, Kerry Smith seconded, to accept part 1 with caveat that the wood-clad windows are to be replacing the vinyl. Roll call vote: Brandon Adair yes, John Hackett yes Joe Hutton yes, Stephanie Lantz yes, Bob Nickrent yes, Reggie Resper yes, Kerry Smith yes Jennifer Plocher Wilkins yes, Tom May yes. Unanimous passage.
2. Front porch renovations – replacing brick steps in landing, columns, wrapping existing concrete piers with brick, new handrail, tapered rectangular columns – Bob Nickrent made motion to approve second part, Kerry seconded. Roll call vote: Brandon Adair yes, John Hackett yes Joe Hutton yes, Stephanie Lantz yes, Bob Nickrent yes, Reggie Resper yes, Kerry Smith yes Jennifer Plocher Wilkins yes, Tom May yes. Unanimous passage.
3. Fence – Joe made motion that fence elevations one or three are acceptable and moved to approve part three of this COA. Bob Nickrent seconded. Roll call vote: Brandon Adair yes, John Hackett yes Joe Hutton yes, Stephanie Lantz yes, Bob Nickrent yes, Reggie Resper yes, Kerry Smith yes Jennifer Plocher Wilkins yes, Tom May yes. Unanimous passage.

V. NEW BUSINESS: Welcome to Stephanie Lantz...newest member of Edwardsville HPC

VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF HPC MEETING IN OCTOBER

Reggie Resper motioned; Brandon Adair seconded to approve October minutes of Edwardsville HPC meeting as submitted. Roll call vote. All 9 board members approved unanimously.

VII. FINANCIAL REPORT

Staff liaison Walt Williams reported that normally the city's budget process occurs in March, but that the city is starting that process several months early this time around. Walt Williams has requested \$5,000 as an annual budget for HPC so the commission can invest in

substantive initiatives and programs such as this year's historic survey of landmark properties in Edwardsville (that study will be completed in late November 2019).

VIII. CORRESPONDENCE - none

IX. COMMITTEE REPORTS

- a. Attaboy Letters
- b. Historic Districts and Landmark Updates
 - 1. Stephenson House
 - 2. Brick Streets
 - 3. Downtown
 - 4. Leclair – Bob Nickrent: Hale Avenue street was finished over to West Lake in time for Leclair Parkfest (kudos to the city on that). Work is moving ahead with the next few blocks. Parkfest was a success again this year. There will not be any luminaria this year at Christmas. The home on Lindenwood that HPC approved a COA for recently for a box addition did sell. Phenomenal job inside.
 - 5. St. Louis Street

- X. OLD BUSINESS** – Joe Hutton presented comments and information based upon an email dialogue with developer Jonathan Fowler who is redeveloping the former Rusty's Restaurant property into a new restaurant on North Main Street. Joe Hutton sent Jonathan Fowler a list of questions relating to loss of the Pogue Store walls. Joe Hutton read HPC members a series of emails from Johnathan Fowler along with Joe's questions. (See image of emailed correspondence at the bottom of these November HPC meeting minutes.)

Joe Hutton's comments, in summary, to HPC: "It's a wonderful thing what the Fowlers are trying to do, but it's sad that the walls weren't salvageable. From this point, it's important that HPC be more involved with what's happening at this location. This is a hugely significant structure. I think there was a disconnect here and not enough communication between all parties...the spirit of the project is gone." At Joe Hutton's request, staff liaison Walt Williams will express HPC's concern to the owner/developer that HPC would like to be more actively involved in the project from this point forward.

XI. NEW BUSINESS

- a. HPC Holiday Party – at Tom's house on Dec. 11, immediately following the HPC meeting
- b. Governors' plaques write-ups (informational) – Cindy Reinhart completed the write-ups for Governors' Plaza. Mayor Hal Patton is planning a March 2020 unveiling. Benches in front of plaques. Mayor Patton wants HPC, Edwardsville High School and others involved. Historical markers for the former Poor Farm and Rusty's will be unveiled on the same day.
- c. May 2020 is Preservation Month. HPC Chairman Tom May asks us to begin thinking about a business and a residence that have done stellar work over the past several years and to let us know.

- d. A National Historic Landmark structure at 112 Springer (the old Barber House) has fallen into serious disrepair, according to Joe Hutton. It is currently unoccupied. The family needs help saving this home. The home's central chimney is on the verge of collapse and needs to be replaced. One foundation wall is failing.

XII. ADJOURNMENT: Next HPC Meeting is Wednesday, December 11, 2019. Chairman Tom May adjourned the November 13, 2019 meeting at 9pm.

Minutes respectfully recorded and submitted 11/16/19 by Kerry Smith, HPC Secretary

Page 1 of 1

Joe Hutton

From: "Joe Hutton" <joe@millermaack.com>
Date: Monday, November 11, 2019 12:45 PM
To: "Walter Williams" <wwilliams@cityofedwardsville.com>; "Tom May" <tmay.hpc@gmail.com>; "Jennifer Wilkins" <jennifer_w@mackeymitchell.com>; "Jennifer Plocher Wilkins" <jenplocher@gmail.com>
Subject: Looking for signed letter

Hi Walter,

E mailing you again regarding the letter I drafted back on September 18th for the Pogue store walls. The last time I sent this request to you all I got back was my draft without city letter head or signatures. At the last meeting you said it had been sent to Mr. Fowler including all signatures. Please provide this letter to me and it's time stamp , prior to Wednesdays meeting. I'll also be asking several questions regarding the loss of the Pogue store brick walls and what the future holds for this Landmarked location.

- * at any time had the landmarked status been lifted for this location ?
 - * what was the reason for the idle time allowed between the major demolition of the Rusty's structure and the recent tearing down of the Pogue brick walls ?
 - * was anyone at the city level alerted to the condition of the Pogue brick walls just prior to their tearing down ?
 - * If so , why was HPC not notified of the problem ? This is a landmarked location and HPCs guidelines require this.
 - * If the city was not alerted , why did this not happen ?
 - * was anyone on the city level in close contact with the property owner , making sure all requirements were being met ?
 - * what is the owners plan for the Pogue store bricks now on pallets ?
 - * what has happened to the landmark plaque which was placed on the Pogue brick walls ?
- Tom , please set aside time in the Old Business part of Wednesdays agenda for answers to these questions.

Respectfully ;
Joe Hutton , member Edwardsville H.P.C.

