

## Edwardsville Historic Preservation Commission

### August Meeting Minutes

**Date: Wednesday, August 14, 2019**

**Time: 7pm**

**Place: Council Chambers, City of Edwardsville City Hall, 118 Hillsboro Avenue, Edwardsville, IL 62025**

**I. CALL TO ORDER**

Commission Chairman Tom May called the meeting to order at 7pm.

**II. ROLL CALL (8 present) – Bob excused absence**

Present: Brandon Adair, Ryan Downey, John Hackett, Joe Hutton, Tom May, Reggie Resper, Kerry Smith and Jennifer Plocher Wilkins. (Excused absence: Bob Nickrent)

**III. NEW BUSINESS** (this portion of the agenda moved up to respect guest speaker's time)

Principal and chief architectural historian Michael Allen, with St. Louis-based Preservation Research Office, presented to HPC. (In 2014, the City of Edwardsville hired Allen to audit/inventory Leclaire Historic District in terms of historical properties). He's now beginning to do the same for the Downtown Edwardsville Historic District. Allen plans to start surveying soon. He will study a total of 103 buildings and 97 parcels along North Main Street in an advisory capacity to the city. (Allen's work is not connected with any federal or state national historic districts nor with the National Park Service.) One boundary of his study area is College Street (the northern wall of the Wildey Theatre). Jennifer Plocher Wilkins questioned why the boundary does not include areas south of College Street. Citizen Karen Zimmerman suggested resources available to Mr. Allen (including a published list of which properties are contributing and which are not contributing). Mr. Allen said that with the previous Leclaire study, his team used the National Register standard, but it's too early to tell exactly what this downtown study will include. A large plat overview, map, set of inventory forms, etc. are among Allen's deliverables. He anticipates his work to take about two months. Questions? Contact Michael Allen: michael@preservationresearch.com or at (314) 920-5680.

**IV. CITIZENS WISHING TO ADDRESS HPC - none**

**V. COA DESIGN REVIEW**

- a. **COA #1:** 1109 Longfellow Avenue (**within Leclaire Historic District**). Owner: Mark Sparks and business partner Tyler Havera
  1. Single-family residence. Request is to replace garage door (because, according to code, the garage door can't be functional due to safety). Tom May did a walk-by and said that the main portion of the home is aluminum siding. Driveway leads to dead end (not a

road). Homeowner wants to replace the garage door with a single-entry door and replace the area with vinyl siding that matches the home.

Ryan Downey made the motion; John Hackett seconded the motion. Roll call vote was unanimously in favor (8-0) of approving COA #1.

- b. **COA #2:** 837 Troy Road (**within LeClaire Historic District**). Owner: Ryan Connor
1. Siding: Motion to accept COA – Single-family residence: request to replace existing aluminum siding with new vinyl siding. Joe Hutton went out to look at the property because homeowner wants to cover over the wood with vinyl. Joe shared his findings (post-property visit), wherein he opened up and viewed 4-5 areas of siding. Joe's impression: in most conditions, you can have a home repainted for less cost than residing it, and it would be more historically accurate. Joe's opinion is that the underlying wood seems to be in good shape. Jennifer Plocher Wilkins asked what the extent is of the project – would the homeowner remove the aluminum covering the original brackets? Homeowner Connor said he hopes to remove the aluminum and restore the brackets. Owner is open to the exposure of vinyl siding of wooden and other historically relevant recommendations and suggestions. No wood would be removed in replacing the siding. Owner said every effort will be made to retain trim pieces. Brandon Adair made the motion to accept, provided the homeowner commits to using a 4-inch lap, 3.5-inch to 4-inch trim around corners and windows and potentially exposed and painted brackets. John Hackett seconded the motion. Roll call vote: Roll call vote was to approve COA #2, 6 yeses (Brandon Adair, Ryan Downey, John Hackett, Reggie Resper, Kerry Smith and Jennifer Plocher Wilkins) and 2 no's (Joe Hutton and Tom May). Motion passed 6-2 in favor of accepting COA #2.
- c. **COA #3:** 409 Franklin Avenue (**within LeClaire Historic District**). Owner: Sherri Wilhite
1. Single-family residence. Old Sears home. This model (1915-1923) is a Hazelwood Model (circa 1920) – highly sought after. Owner is requesting new vinyl siding to cover the existing, original wood siding. John Hackett asked for the source of the term “technically infeasible.” Jennifer Plocher Wilkins says this term does not come from our HPC guidelines. Tom May said there is some variability in the definition, and it may depend upon the nuances of the specific scenario. Joe Hutton distinguished “technically” infeasible from “financially” infeasible. Tom May says siding is in great shape, Joe Hutton agreed and said the species of wood is durable to weather...quality of trees doesn't exist anymore. Original siding is still on the home (except for sides of the dormer, which have vinyl). This home came in on a railcar (according to Joe Hutton) and was likely manufactured in Cairo, IL (Sears manufacturing plant) (according to Tom May). Tom has been in this home and verified that every piece is labeled (as to how it was fit together). Walt also said the wood is in solid condition, with very minimal paint bubbling. New commission member Reggie Resper asked the commission to clarify what the material difference was between the crux of COA #2 and COA #3. Several HPC members responded, clarifying that the significant difference between the two COAs was the property mentioned in COA #2 (837 Troy Road) already had siding from years prior to

there being a (Leclaire) historic district. In COA #2, the siding has become damaged and the homeowner requested that he be able to replace that damaged siding. In COA #3 (409 Franklin, a residential property that is also located within the Leclaire Historic District), the home has original siding that is considered to be in good to excellent condition and should (according to HPC guidelines) be maintained. Chairman Tom May pointed out the term “technically infeasible” appears in our commission’s guidelines 15 times. Pages 28 and 29 of HPC’s official guidelines offer this definition of technically infeasible: “Not possible to accomplish something due to substantial additional cost in comparison to approved alternative methods that meet these guidelines.”

Motion to approve, seconded. Joe made motion to accept the COA for discussion, John seconded motion. Roll call vote: 8-0 no (Brandon Adair, Ryan Downey, John Hackett, Joe Hutton, Tom May, Reggie Resper, Kerry Smith and Jennifer Plocher Wilkins favor of denying COA (denying vinyl siding) of COA #3.

- d. **COA #4:** 522 Jefferson Road (**within Downtown Historic District**). Owner: Caleb Carr
  - 1. Single-family residence, homeowner is requesting permission to erect a wooden fence. There is not currently a fence there. The proposed fencing design is gapped (dog-eared), with a slight opening in the fence in the front and back of house/yard. Jennifer Plocher Wilkins made the motion to accept the COA. Ryan Downey seconded. Roll call vote: 8-0, unanimous in favor of approving COA #4.

**VI. (MORE) NEW BUSINESS** – Robert Klaus, chairman of Madison County Historical Society’s restoration committee, made a presentation specific to the museum’s original warehouse, located at 715 North Main Street. Mr. Klaus presented to HPC in advance of plans to apply for a COA to propose renovations. This structure is currently vacant and is undergoing restoration and rehabilitation. An addition was made to house in 1929; the current porch is believed to have been added at same time. No major alterations have been made to the structure, and deterioration has taken place. (In 1963-64, when the Society purchased this structure, that was likely the last time any alterations were made.) Due to ADA and parking issues, etc., the rear door will become the main entrance to the museum. A wheelchair ramp will be altered to meet code (ADA) so accessible parking can be added to the south (at the same grade level as the ramp). Support beams have rotted into the support foundation. The Society is proposing to raise the floor level of the porch by 7 inches so that it’s no more than a half-inch lower than the flooring inside (for accessibility). The railing and floorboards are rotted. Society proposes replacing like with like. The group is working with The Korte Company (design-build contractor). Klaus plans to return to HPC with a formal COA application specific to this proposed project.

**VII. APPROVAL OF JULY MINUTES OF HPC** – Joe Hutton motioned, Kerry Smith seconded to approve the July 2019 HPC meeting minutes as recorded by Ryan Downey and amended. HPC members unanimously approved the minutes.

**VIII. FINANCIAL REPORT** – None.

**IX. CORRESPONDENCE** – None. Sappington House (Joe Hutton). Joe toured it. Great job on Stephenson House, Sappington faces same challenges. Good thing.

**X. COMMITTEE REPORTS**

- a. Atta-boy letters – Taste of Heaven letter (tuckpointing side of building). Walt will send out letter.
- b. Historic districts and Landmarks updates – None.
  1. Stephenson House
  2. Brick Streets
  3. Downtown
  4. Leclair
  5. St. Louis Street

**XI. OLD BUSINESS** – None. (Karen Zimmerman’s COA is tabled.)

**XII. NEW BUSINESS** –

- 1) Jennifer Plocher Wilkins – can we get the COAs in advance of the agenda coming out?
- 2) Joe Hutton – Old Leclair Depot is being moved to new site (slightly south of its current location); Jennifer Plocher Wilkins said the agreement is between the city and Lewis & Clark Community College. Joe Hutton requested that HPC is kept in the loop on the design details of this project. He said the new location will be terrific.
- 3) HPC welcomed its newest member of the commission, Reggie Resper. Reggie owns and operates a residential RE company. Reggie is a new resident living on St. Louis Street as of June.

**ADJOURNMENT:** Our next regular HPC meeting is September 11, 2019. The August meeting adjourned at 8:27pm.

Minutes respectfully recorded and submitted by Kerry Smith

