

Edwardsville Historic Preservation Commission

June Meeting Minutes

Date: Wednesday, June 12, 2019

Time: 7pm

Place: Council Chambers, City of Edwardsville City Hall, 118 Hillsboro Avenue, Edwardsville, IL 62025

I. CALL TO ORDER

Commission Chairman Tom May called the meeting to order at 7pm.

II. ROLL CALL

Present: Brandon Adair, John Hackett, Joe Hutton, Chairman Tom May, Bob Nickrent and Kerry Smith (excused absences: Jeanne Coyle, Ryan Downey, Jennifer Wilkins, staff liaison Walter Williams) Staff present: City Planner Emily Fultz, Public Works Director Eric Williams

III. CITIZENS WISHING TO ADDRESS HPC (none)

IV. COA DESIGN REVIEW

- a. **COA #1: 832 Holyoake Rd. (within Leclaire Historic District).** Owner: Linda Shaffer
 1. Concrete Driveway – replacing gravel driveway with poured concrete driveway (to extend where it was gravel before and to join city sidewalk).
Bob Nickrent motioned to approve; John Hackett seconded. Roll call vote was unanimous in favor (6-0) of approving COA #1.

- b. **COA #2: 202 Franklin Ave. (within Leclaire Historic District).** Owner: Zachary Harrison.
 1. Porch – Brandon Adair motioned to accept COA, John Hackett seconded. Replacement of wood-frame front porch with wood-frame front porch, tongue and groove decking and new wood steps. Termites damaged the existing front porch. Zachary is a landlord for this property and several other properties, some also in Leclaire.
There's also a window project (not in this COA). Interior wood-frame windows are not in good shape. Joe Hutton asked that the HPC windows guidelines be read, so Chairman Tom May recited the gist of the window policy. Zachary's grandfather said the 1928 home was remodeled in the 1960s. Eric Williams said landlord didn't have a permit to begin the porch project, so that's why there was a stop work order issued. Joe Hutton says these window sashes are original to this home. Tom May says Zachary needs to come back with a separate COA that's specific to windows. (So HPC is just giving advice tonight as to the windows rather than voting on windows.) Joe Hutton offered to come by to eyeball existing windows. Kerry Smith moved to accept COA #2, John Hackett seconded. Roll call vote: Unanimous (6-0) to COA #2 which is germane to the porch replacement. Eric Williams will get the stop work order lifted so Zachary can continue.

- c. **COA #3: 1301 N. Main St. (within Downtown Historic District).** Owner: Karen Zimmerman (purchased 800-square-foot property 5 years ago – in TIF – she reported that nothing indicated on her deed that this property was in a historic district...she and her husband, co-property owners, thought it was a 1948 home.)

1. Demolition: Tom May read the HPC guidelines specifying all the photos that must be presented to city in order to discuss COA #3.

City Planner Emily Fultz read and explained the process by which a certificate of economic hardship relative to a demolition request must proceed. Emily Fultz also explained that Karen Zimmerman's COA needs to be submitted first, but that it needs to have documentation that has not yet been submitted with the COA application. The property owner needs to also submit photos and a basic floorplan (not needed to come from an architect) of the interior of the structure. The 2 separate requests that need to come from the property owner are:

- a. Landmarks COA for complete demo and replacement of existing structure with grass
- b. Certificate of economic hardship application

Commercial guidelines (Section 7 and 7.2 – alternatives to demolition). apply and a chapter out of the city code of ordinances. Chapter 7. Section 54 of code of ordinances provides requirements – economic hardship may only proceed if the COA for demolition is denied. John Hackett advised Karen Zimmerman to look at the requirements of a COA and Emily Fultz said Karen needs: a scaled floorplan and the necessary photos (neither of which Karen Zimmerman submitted on with the current COA form) and the supplemental info on page 57. As per the city's ordinance outlining a request for a certification of economic hardship, John Hackett walked Karen Zimmerman through the requirements/factors for a certificate of economic hardship. John Hackett recommended that Karen Zimmerman fulfill the COA requirements first. John Hackett moved to table the COA until property owner can return and present the complete application with required supplemental details. Bob Nickrent seconded to table the COA (until further info is provided). Roll call was unanimous, 6-0, in favor of tabling COA #3.

- d. **COA #4: 1107 Lake Ave. (within LeClaire Historic District).** Owner: Aaron Jarrell, contractor (speaking on behalf of the homeowners Rebecca & Joe Krajnovich. John Hackett made a motion to accept COA #4 and Joe Hutton seconded.

Homeowners are requesting permission to demolish existing single-car garage and build a new 2-car, 24x30-foot garage in the center of the lot, 46 feet behind the house and 20 feet from the alleyway. When extended, the roof slope will be a 6 and 12 (per Joe Hutton's recommendation and agreed upon by contractor Jarrell). Homeowners and contractor request using ~~aluminum soffit~~ **exposed rafter tails**. Would like to remove sidewalk on side of home but keep front sidewalk, and create a driveway that will adjoin with the new garage (pour new concrete), create new sidewalk to steps of a deck, and replace the smaller, rotting, back yard deck with a new 14x20-foot deck.

Bob Nickrent moved, and Joe Hutton seconded to break COA #4 into separate parts:

- a. Demolishing garage (built in 2001) and removal of concrete as outlined – contractor is willing to add a small swale. Joe Hutton made motion to approve, Bob Nickrent seconded. Roll call vote: 6-0 yes to accept proposal as submitted.

- b. Construct concrete walkway (install meandering side from back porch to front via side yard) – see HPC design guidelines, page 26 – Joe Hutton made motion to accept, John Hackett seconded. Roll call vote: 6-0 yes to accept proposal as submitted.

- e. **COA #5: 837 Troy Road (within Leclaire Historic District).** Owner: Ryan Connor. Kerry Smith motioned to accept COA #5, Joe Hutton seconded.

Hail damage Repair Request: Single-family residence. Connor family bought home in 2010. Not sure what year aluminum was installed prior to that. Homeowner is seeking to replace vinyl with .046 (according to contractor) to meet specs (HPC standard is 0.044 thickness). Contractor recommends placing thin layer of foam over wood and between vinyl (due to suspected lead underneath and costly abatement). Owner doesn't want to remove wood. Just wants to go over the wood, remove aluminum and replace with vinyl. Joe Hutton said he'd like to see aluminum to come off to reveal original wood, but the brackets should not be removed. It's not possible to obtain the same aluminum that was originally put on the home. Awesome craftsman-style home. Owner is excited about south-facing wall, that there may be an original window – possibly stain or leaded glass – that was covered up. Scope of this project and tonight's COA, however, is merely the siding. Homeowner said he is open to any and all suggestions from HPC on additional work he plans to do in the future. HPC would like to see homeowner restore the original wood siding, but if that's not possible (due to lead abatement being cost prohibitive, etc.), homeowner should restore the brackets. Joe Hutton (is concerned about HPC getting to eyeball the wood before we say it can be covered up with alternative material and) has offered to come and look at home and see if lead abatement is possible and affordable. Owner is asking for a vote on the COA tonight so that he isn't in limbo and in jeopardy of losing his contractor and keeping the insurance adjustment process on track. Bob Nickrent reminded the HPC that homeowner is in a catch 22 because he can't replace like with like since that aluminum product/size is no longer available. John Hackett cautioned an individual HPC member representing the group on this (just Joe's eyeballs), but Joe Hutton says there is precedent for this. John Hackett motioned to approve COA, Bob Nickrent seconded. Roll call vote: Vote was tied 3-3 (YES – Brandon Adair, John Hackett, Kerry Smith) (NO – Joe Hutton, Tom May, Bob Nickrent) so COA #5 was not approved. Homeowner would still like Joe Hutton to come over and eyeball home's existing siding/wood with Joe acting as a private, individual expert (not as a rep on behalf of HPC). Joe agreed.

- V. **APPROVAL OF MARCH MINUTES OF HPC** – Approval of May 2019 HPC meeting minutes was tabled because HPC members have not seen them yet.

VI. **FINANCIAL REPORT**

VII. **CORRESPONDENCE**

VIII. **COMMITTEE REPORTS**

- a. Atta-boy letters – None.
- b. Historic districts and Landmarks updates

1. Stephenson House
2. Brick Streets
3. Downtown
4. Leclair
5. St. Louis Street

IX. OLD BUSINESS – Route 66 Festival was great (took place weekend of June 7-9) – Trolley tour was well attended. (Tom hosted 6 tours in 2 hours), and Brandon also volunteered to help at the Route 66 Festival on behalf of HPC.

Cindy Reinhardt is willing to move some HPC/city historic relics from city hall and public works to the Madison County Historical Museum.

HPC's very first local preservation awards were given out by former HPC Chair Jennifer Wilkins at the Edwardsville City Council meeting on 5/21/19. Three additional commission members were in attendance (Tom May, Kerry Smith, Brandon Adair).

X. NEW BUSINESS

ADJOURNMENT: Our next regular HPC meeting is July 10, 2019. Meeting adjourned at 9:01pm.

Minutes respectfully recorded and submitted by Kerry Smith